THE EFFECTIVENESS AND USE OF MENTORS IN NURSING LEADERSHIP IN HEALTHCARE SETTINGS

Barbara Pinekenstein DNP, RN-BC, CPHIMS
Richard E. Sinaiko Professor in Health Care Leadership
University of Wisconsin, School of Nursing, Madison
Building Bridges to Research Based Nursing Practice Conference
May 13, 2016

Overview and Background

• Nurses need to be prepared to lead change and advance health including partnering with other interdisciplinary leaders (IOM, 2011)
• Leadership development is a strategic goal (AONE, 2011)
• Aging of nursing workforce resulting in increased need for succession planning and leadership development
• Research identified significant benefits of mentoring
• Mentoring identified as a promising practice for knowledge translation

Review of Literature

Key topics

• Definitions and benefits of mentoring
• Mentoring in corporations
• Types of mentoring-Formal and Informal
• Antecedents of mentoring including gender
• Phases of mentoring
• Mentoring and leadership development including linkages to transformational leadership

Review of Literature

• Databases
  - CINAHL, EbscoHost, Science Direct, Health Sciences Journals, Pub Med, PsycINFO, and ProQuest for full text English from 1999 to 2014
• Excluded youth mentoring and academic mentoring
• Focused on workplace, healthcare, and nursing mentoring linked to leadership development
• Selected academic medicine mentoring with a focus on career development
• Included seminal work of Kram (1985) and Levinson (1978)
Definitions

• An experienced individual with advanced knowledge, who provides assistance to protégé’s career (Kram, 1985)
• Developmental process between 3 parties-mentor, protégé, organization (Jakubik, 2008)
• Informal
• Formal

Literature Review

Benefits

• Mentor and protégé
• Professional and psychosocial development
• Career satisfaction
• Lower levels of job stress

Use of Conceptual Framework

• Informed the design and development of survey tool
• Variables of the study and survey questions were linked to targeted areas of the framework
• Results were compared to themes identified in the conceptual framework and review of literature
Research Purpose

• Examine the use and perceptions of formal and informal mentors in the leadership development of nursing leaders, specifically nursing directors and executives within healthcare settings.

Aims

• Determine the perceived value and experience as a mentor and protégé by nursing leaders including nurse executive role.
• Compare the descriptions of mentorship experiences between nursing directors and nurse executives.
• Identify barriers to mentoring.
• Identify awareness of formal mentoring programs (AONE, WONE, VHA).

Study Design

• A cross sectional, survey research method.
• Email with Qualtrics web link.
• Wisconsin Organization of Nurse Executives and Wisconsin Center for Nursing leader resource list.
• Results analyzed with descriptive statistics.
• Thematic analysis used for four qualitative questions.

Tool design

• Nurse Leader Mentoring Effectiveness Survey-30 item.
• Designed by researcher with input from colleagues.
• Includes the modified mentorship profile questionnaire and a mentorship effectiveness scale from the John Hopkins School of Nursing (Berk, Berg, Mortimer, Walton-Moss & Yeo, 2005).
Study - Demographics

- Respondents – 109/325 for a 34% response rate
  - Managers -14%
  - Directors - 29%
  - CNOs/VPs -34%
  - Average age - 52.8 years
  - Hospital and Healthcare setting - 78%

Results - Use of Mentors

- Mentor relationship is informal - 65%
- Most influential mentor informal - 80%
- When a formal mentorship exists it is typically sponsored by:
  - Current employer - 69%
  - Past employer - 14%
  - Professional organization - 6%
  - Leadership development program - 3%
Results
Mentor Disciplines Outside of Nursing

Results
Discipline of Most Influential Mentor

Results
Career Stage for Most Influential Mentor

Results
Length of Mentor Relationship

- Mentors
- Number of Respondents
- Number of responses
- Number of responses
- Number of responses
This slide's placement is a little confusing. Probably will make more sense to me when you are presenting.
Quinn Mullikin, 4/27/2015
**Results**

**Outcomes from Most Influential Mentor Relationship**

- Leadership development: 40%
- Professional networking: 30%
- Higher job satisfaction: 20%
- Career path guidance: 10%
- Increased organizational commitment: 5%
- Career balance: 3%
- Program development: 2%
- Public speaking: 1%
- Service activities: 1%
- Improved time management: 1%
- Writing and publication: 1%
- Other: 1%

**Results**

**Succession Planning**

I am currently a mentor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mentee %</th>
<th>Nursing Leaders</th>
<th>CNO/VP</th>
<th>Director</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Results**

**Succession Planning (cont.)**

One of more Mentee's that I have mentored have been identified as potential successors

- Nursing Leaders: 80%
- CNO/VP: 70%
- Director: 60%

**Results**

**Mentor Effectiveness**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mentor Effectiveness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nursing Leaders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNO/VP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Director</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Comparison of Mentoring CNO and Directors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mentor Variable</th>
<th>CNO</th>
<th>Director</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proactive in seeking mentor</td>
<td>54.6%</td>
<td>51.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male mentor</td>
<td>29.6%</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of mentor –outside organization</td>
<td>57.7%</td>
<td>30.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal mentors</td>
<td>59.3%</td>
<td>70.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse leader as mentor</td>
<td>62.9%</td>
<td>92.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct supervisor mentor</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>40.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Barriers to Mentoring

- Time and scheduling constraints
- Continuity
- Selection-finding the right mentor
- Quality of relationship
- Supervisory concerns

Best Practices

- Mentor selection- Proactive
- Right fit for needs and career stage
- Frequency and structure

Conclusions

- Mentoring is an effective strategy to increase leadership development
- In this study the perceived effectiveness was high
- Nursing Leaders use informal mentoring more than formal
- Only 24% of nursing leaders had a current mentor
- Limited use of mentors originating outside the field of nursing
- Limited use of multiple mentors
Recommendations
Three levels of impact

- Individual
  - Encourage the development of a mentoring plan
  - Use of multiple mentors at different career stages
- Nurse Executives
  - Role model transformational leadership and mentoring
  - Support a culture of mentoring
- Organizations
  - Support a culture of mentoring
  - Establish the infrastructure with appropriate rewards and recognition

Implications to Practice and Research

- Mentoring programs potential to enhance:
  - Knowledge translation (KT) resulting in better clinical and organizational decision making
  - Leadership development
  - Succession Planning

Limitations

- Sample based on nursing leaders in Wisconsin only
- Self-report of mentoring over a variety of career stages and timelines
- Limited validity of survey tool

Thank you

- Wisconsin Organization of Nurse Executives
- Wisconsin Center of Nursing
- Capstone Committee
- Nursing Leaders in Wisconsin
References


References

References

  Nursing Outlook, 22(5), 16-23. doi:10.1016/S0029-6554(94)80017-0
  Publishing.
  mentoring relationship for nurse leadership. Nursing Inquiry, 10(4), 126-136. doi: 
  10.1111/j.1440-180X.2003.00491.x
  being: Findings from an Australian hermeneutic phenomenological study. Journal of 
  Nursing Scholarship, 43, 97-104.
  (Eds.) The handbook of mentoring at work: Theory, research, and practice. doi: 
  10.1177/0734382407305273
• Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications.
• Metcalfe, S. E. (2010). Educational innovation: Collaborative mentoring for future 
  nursing leaders. Creative Nursing, 16(4), 167-170. doi:10.21911/t78–j53.16-167
• Montague, W., & Vasilev, V. (2016). Mentorship in developing transformational leaders 
  to advance health policy: Creating a culture of health. Nurse Leader, 13(1), 05-69.
References

  StateWorkforce_new.pdf
  nsin%20Nurses%20on%20Boards%20Survey%20Report%20FIN
  Al%20072814.pdf